
FIFTEEN YEARS OF GUIDELINES SENTENCING

An Assessment of How Well the
Federal Criminal Justice System is
Achieving the Goals of Sentencing Reform



UNITED STATES SENTENCING COMMISSION

November 2004



Submitted to

Ricardo H. Hinojosa
Chair

Ruben Castillo
Vice Chair

William K. Sessions, III
Vice Chair

John R. Steer
Vice Chair

Michael E. Horowitz
Commissioner

Michael E. O'Neill
Commissioner

Deborah Rhodes
(ex officio)

Edward F. Reilly, Jr.
(ex officio)

Prepared by

Paul J. Hofer
Charles Loeffler
Kevin Blackwell
Patricia Valentino

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	iv
Preface	xviii
Chapter One: Introduction to the Sentencing Reform Act	1
A. The History of the Sentencing Reform Act	1
1. The Roots of Reform	1
2. Legislative Development of the SRA	3
B. Goals and Purposes of the SRA	11
1. The Goals of Sentencing Reform	11
2. The Purposes of Punishment	12
C. The Commission’s Implementation of the SRA	14
1. Guidelines Drafting Procedures	14
2. How the Guidelines Determine the Presumptive Sentence	16
D. Components of the Reformed Sentencing System	18
1. Components of Guidelines Development	19
2. Components of Guidelines Implementation	22
E. From Theory to Practice	35
Chapter Two: Impact of the Sentencing Guidelines on the Certainty and Severity of Punishment	38
A. Introduction to the Chapter and the Data	38
1. Sentencing Policy and the Scale of Imprisonment	38
2. Assembling the Data	40
B. The Increased Certainty of Imprisonment	41
1. Historical Development of Use of Imprisonment in the Federal System .	41
2. Overall Trends in the Use of Imprisonment	42
C. The Increased Severity of Prison Sentences	45
1. The Elimination of Parole and the Importance of Time Served	45
2. Overall Trends in Sentencing Severity	46
D. Variations Among Different Offense Types	47
1. Drug Trafficking Offenses	47
2. Economic Offenses	55
3. Immigration Offenses	61
4. Firearm Trafficking and Possession	65
5. Violent Crimes	68
6. Sexual Abuse, Exploitation, and Transportation for Illegal Sexual Activities	72

E.	Certainty, Severity, and the Scale of Imprisonment	75
1.	Policymaking in the Guidelines Era	75
2.	Sentencing Guidelines: A New Instrument of Policy Control	77
Chapter Three: Presentencing, Inter-judge, and Regional Disparity		79
A.	Introduction	79
1.	Definitions of Disparity	79
2.	Increased Transparency of the Sentencing Decision	80
B.	Disparity Arising at Presentencing Stages	81
1.	Presentencing Stages That Can Affect Sentencing Uniformity	82
2.	Surveys Suggest Disparity Results from Presentencing Stages	85
3.	Field Studies Suggest Disparity Results from Presentencing Stages	86
4.	Quantifying the Extent of Disparity Arising at Presentencing Stages	88
5.	Presentencing Stages, Disparity, and the Mechanisms Designed to Control It	92
C.	Inter-judge and Regional Sentencing Disparity	93
1.	The Effects of the Guidelines on Inter-judge and Regional Disparity	94
2.	Evidence of Inter-judge and Regional Variation in the Preguidelines Era	94
3.	Research Concerning the Guidelines’ Effects on Disparity	95
4.	Recent Research Concerning the Guidelines’ Effects on Disparity	97
D.	Continuing Disparity Under the Guidelines	99
1.	Continuing Regional and Inter-judge Disparities	99
2.	Mechanisms for Disparity Within the Guidelines System	102
3.	Departures Upon Motion of the Government	103
4.	Variability of Within-Guidelines Sentences	107
5.	Departures for Exceptional Circumstances	110
Chapter Four: Racial, Ethnic, and Gender Disparities In Federal Sentencing Today		113
A.	Examining Group Differences	113
1.	Disparity, Discrimination, and Adverse Impacts	113
2.	A Growing Minority Caseload	114
3.	A Growing Gap in Sentencing	115
B.	Studying Racial, Ethnic, and Gender Discrimination in Sentencing	117
1.	Continuing Concern in the Guidelines Era	117
2.	Research on Discrimination under the Guidelines	118
C.	Results from Recent Research	119
1.	Racial and Ethnic Disparity	120
2.	Gender Disparity	127
3.	Research on Departures, Sentencing Options, and Placement Within the Guideline Range	128

D.	Rules Having Significant Adverse Impacts	130
1.	The 100-1 Powder to Crack Cocaine Ratio	131
2.	Using Prior Drug Trafficking Convictions to Define Career Offenders ..	133
E.	Conclusion	134
Chapter Five:	Summary and Conclusions	136
A.	Substantially Achieved Goals of the SRA	136
1.	Increased Rationality and Transparency	136
2.	Increased Certainty and Severity of Punishment	138
B.	Partially Achieved Goals of the SRA	140
1.	Reduction of Unwarranted Sentencing Disparity	140
2.	A High Standard of Sentencing Uniformity	142
C.	Partial Implementation of the Components of Sentencing Reform	143
1.	Components of Guidelines Implementation	144
2.	Components of Guidelines Policy Development	145
APPENDIX		
A.	Bibliography	A-1
B.	Congressional Directives to the Commission	B-1
C.	Survey of Article III Judges on the Federal Sentencing Guidelines	C-1
D.	Technical Appendix	D-1