FIFTEEN YEARS OF GUIDELINES SENTENCING

An Assessment of How Well the Federal Criminal Justice System is Achieving the Goals of Sentencing Reform

United States Sentencing Commission
November 2004
## Table of Contents

Executive Summary ........................................................................................................ iv

Preface ......................................................................................................................... xviii

Chapter One: Introduction to the Sentencing Reform Act ............................................. 1

A. The History of the Sentencing Reform Act ............................................................. 1
   1. The Roots of Reform ....................................................................................... 1
   2. Legislative Development of the SRA ........................................................... 3

B. Goals and Purposes of the SRA .......................................................................... 11
   1. The Goals of Sentencing Reform .................................................................. 11
   2. The Purposes of Punishment ......................................................................... 12

C. The Commission’s Implementation of the SRA .................................................. 14
   1. Guidelines Drafting Procedures ..................................................................... 14
   2. How the Guidelines Determine the Presumptive Sentence ......................... 16

D. Components of the Reformed Sentencing System ............................................. 18
   1. Components of Guidelines Development ....................................................... 19
   2. Components of Guidelines Implementation ................................................ 22

E. From Theory to Practice ....................................................................................... 35

Chapter Two: Impact of the Sentencing Guidelines on the Certainty and Severity of Punishment ................................................................. 38

A. Introduction to the Chapter and the Data ............................................................... 38
   1. Sentencing Policy and the Scale of Imprisonment ........................................ 38
   2. Assembling the Data .................................................................................... 40

B. The Increased Certainty of Imprisonment ............................................................ 41
   1. Historical Development of Use of Imprisonment in the Federal System ....... 41
   2. Overall Trends in the Use of Imprisonment ................................................ 42

C. The Increased Severity of Prison Sentences ......................................................... 45
   1. The Elimination of Parole and the Importance of Time Served .................... 45
   2. Overall Trends in Sentencing Severity ....................................................... 46

D. Variations Among Different Offense Types ......................................................... 47
   1. Drug Trafficking Offenses ........................................................................... 47
   2. Economic Offenses ...................................................................................... 55
   3. Immigration Offenses .................................................................................. 61
   4. Firearm Trafficking and Possession ............................................................ 65
   5. Violent Crimes ............................................................................................. 68
   6. Sexual Abuse, Exploitation, and Transportation for Illegal Sexual Activities .................................................................................................................. 72
Chapter Three: Presentencing, Inter-judge, and Regional Disparity ................................. 79

A. Introduction .......................................................... 79
   1. Definitions of Disparity ........................................ 79
   2. Increased Transparency of the Sentencing Decision ........ 80

B. Disparity Arising at Presentencing Stages .................................................. 81
   1. Presentencing Stages That Can Affect Sentencing Uniformity ........ 82
   2. Surveys Suggest Disparity Results from Presentencing Stages ...... 85
   3. Field Studies Suggest Disparity Results from Presentencing Stages . 86
   4. Quantifying the Extent of Disparity Arising at Presentencing Stages ... 88
   5. Presentencing Stages, Disparity, and the Mechanisms Designed to Control It .................................................. 92

C. Inter-judge and Regional Sentencing Disparity ............................................. 93
   1. The Effects of the Guidelines on Inter-judge and Regional Disparity ...... 94
   2. Evidence of Inter-judge and Regional Variation in the Preguidelines Era . 94
   3. Research Concerning the Guidelines’ Effects on Disparity ................. 95
   4. Recent Research Concerning the Guidelines’ Effects on Disparity ........ 97

D. Continuing Disparity Under the Guidelines ................................................. 99
   1. Continuing Regional and Inter-judge Disparities .................... 99
   2. Mechanisms for Disparity Within the Guidelines System .......... 102
   3. Departures Upon Motion of the Government ........................ 103
   4. Variability of Within-Guidelines Sentences ........................ 107
   5. Departures for Exceptional Circumstances .......................... 110

Chapter Four: Racial, Ethnic, and Gender Disparities In Federal Sentencing Today ........ 113

A. Examining Group Differences .................................................. 113
   1. Disparity, Discrimination, and Adverse Impacts ..................... 113
   2. A Growing Minority Caseload ..................................... 114
   3. A Growing Gap in Sentencing ..................................... 115

B. Studying Racial, Ethnic, and Gender Discrimination in Sentencing .................... 117
   1. Continuing Concern in the Guidelines Era .......................... 117
   2. Research on Discrimination under the Guidelines .................... 118

C. Results from Recent Research .................................................. 119
   1. Racial and Ethnic Disparity ...................................... 120
   2. Gender Disparity .................................................. 127
   3. Research on Departures, Sentencing Options, and Placement Within the Guideline Range .............................................. 128
D. Rules Having Significant Adverse Impacts .................................................. 130
   1. The 100-1 Powder to Crack Cocaine Ratio ........................................ 131
   2. Using Prior Drug Trafficking Convictions to Define Career Offenders .... 133
E. Conclusion ................................................................................................. 134

Chapter Five: Summary and Conclusions .................................................... 136

A. Substantially Achieved Goals of the SRA ............................................... 136
   1. Increased Rationality and Transparency .............................................. 136
   2. Increased Certainty and Severity of Punishment .................................. 138
B. Partially Achieved Goals of the SRA ...................................................... 140
   1. Reduction of Unwarranted Sentencing Disparity ................................. 140
   2. A High Standard of Sentencing Uniformity ......................................... 142
C. Partial Implementation of the Components of Sentencing Reform ............. 143
   1. Components of Guidelines Implementation ........................................ 144
   2. Components of Guidelines Policy Development ................................. 145

APPENDIX
A. Bibliography ............................................................................................. A-1
B. Congressional Directives to the Commission ........................................... B-1
D. Technical Appendix ................................................................................. D-1