

# Amendment to the Sentencing Guidelines

January 21, 2016

# *Effective Date* August 1, 2016

This document contains unofficial text of an amendment to the <u>Guidelines Manual</u> submitted to Congress, and is provided only for the convenience of the user. Official text of the amendment can be found on the Commission's website at <u>www.ussc.gov</u> and will appear in a forthcoming edition of the <u>Federal Register</u>.

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

## AMENDMENT

#### PAGE NO.

1. "CRIME OF VIOLENCE" AND RELATED ISSUES
---

The United States Sentencing Commission is an independent agency in the judicial branch of the United States Government. The Commission promulgates sentencing guidelines and policy statements for federal sentencing courts pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 994(a). The Commission also periodically reviews and revises previously promulgated guidelines pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 994(o) and generally submits guideline amendments to Congress pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 994(p) not later than the first day of May each year. Absent action of Congress to the contrary, submitted amendments become effective by operation of law on the date specified by the Commission (generally November 1 of the year in which the amendments are submitted to Congress).

The Commission specified an effective date of **August 1, 2016** for the amendment listed above and included in this document.

# AMENDMENT: "CRIME OF VIOLENCE" AND RELATED ISSUES

**Reason for Amendment:** This amendment is a result of the Commission's multi-year study of statutory and guideline definitions relating to the nature of a defendant's prior conviction (e.g., "crime of violence," "aggravated felony," "violent felony," "drug trafficking offense," and "felony drug offense") and the impact of such definitions on the relevant statutory and guideline provisions (e.g., career offender, illegal reentry, and armed career criminal). As part of this study, the Commission considered feedback from the field, including conducting a roundtable discussion on these topics and considering the varying case law interpreting these statutory and guideline definitions. In particular, the Commission has received extensive comment, and is aware of numerous court opinions, expressing a view that the definition of "crime of violence" is complex and unclear. The amendment is informed by this public comment and case law, as well as the Supreme Court's recent decision in Johnson v. United States, 135 S. Ct. 2551 (2015), regarding the statutory definition of "violent felony" in 18 U.S.C. § 924(e) (commonly referred to as the "Armed Career Criminal Act" or "ACCA"). While not addressing the guidelines, that decision has given rise to significant litigation regarding the guideline definition of "crime of violence." Finally, the Commission analyzed a range of sentencing data, including a study of the sentences relative to the guidelines for the career offender guidelines. See U.S. Sent's Comm'n, *Quick Facts: Career Offenders (Nov. 2015) (highlighting the decreasing rate of within range guideline* sentences (27.5% in fiscal year 2014), which has been coupled with increasing rates of government (45.6%) and non-government sponsored below range sentences (25.9%)).

The amendment makes several changes to the definition of "crime of violence" at §4B1.2 (Definitions of Terms Used in Section 4B1.1), which, prior to this amendment, was defined as any offense under federal or state law, punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year, that

- *has as an element the use, attempted use, or threatened use of physical force against the person of another ("force clause" or "elements clause"), see* §4B1.2(a)(1);
- *is murder, manslaughter, kidnapping, aggravated assault, forcible sex offenses, robbery, arson, extortion, extortionate extension of credit, burglary of a dwelling, or involves the use of explosives ("enumerated offenses"), see §4B1.2(a)(2) and comment. (n.1); or*
- otherwise involves conduct that presents a serious potential risk of physical injury to another ("residual clause"), see §4B1.2(a)(2).

The "crime of violence" definition at §4B1.2 is used to trigger increased sentences under several provisions in the Guidelines Manual, the most significant of which is §4B1.1 (Career Offender). See also *§§2K1.3, 2K2.1, 2S1.1, 4A1.1(e), 7B1.1.* The career offender guideline implements a directive to the *Commission set forth at 28 U.S.C. § 994(h), which in turn identifies offenders for whom the guidelines* must provide increased punishment. Tracking the criteria set forth in section 994(h), the Commission implemented the directive by identifying a defendant as a career offender if (1) the defendant was at least eighteen years old at the time he or she committed the instant offense of conviction; (2) the instant offense is a felony that is a crime of violence or a controlled substance offense, and (3) the defendant has at least two prior felony convictions of either a crime of violence or a controlled substance offense. Where these criteria are met, the directive at section 994(h), and therefore §4B1.1, provides for significantly higher sentences under the guidelines, such that the guideline range is "at or near the maximum [term of imprisonment] authorized." Commission data shows that application of §4B1.1 resulted in an increased final offense level, an increased Criminal History Category, or both for 91.3 percent of defendants sentenced under the career offender guideline in fiscal year 2014. See U.S. Sent'g Comm'n, Quick Facts: Career Offenders (Nov. 2015) (46.3% of career offenders received an increase in both final offense level (from an average of 23 levels to 31 levels) and criminal history category (from an average of category IV

to category VI); 32.6% had just a higher final offense level (from an average of 23 levels to 30 levels); and 12.4% had just a higher Criminal History Category (from an average of category IV to category VI)).

# Residual Clause

First, the amendment deletes the "residual clause" at \$4B1.2(a)(2). Prior to the amendment, the term "crime of violence" in §4B1.2 included any offense that "otherwise involves conduct that presents a serious potential risk of physical injury to another." In Johnson, the Supreme Court considered an identical residual clause relating to the statutory definition of "violent felony" in the Armed Career Criminal Act. The Court held that using the "residual clause" to classify an offense as a "violent felony" violated due process because the clause was unconstitutionally vague. See Johnson, 135 S. Ct. at 2563. While the Supreme Court in Johnson did not consider or address the sentencing guidelines, significant litigation has ensued regarding whether the Supreme Court's holding in Johnson should also apply to the residual clause in §4B1.2. Compare United States v. Matchett, 802 F.3d 1185 (11th Cir. 2015) (rejecting the argument that the residual clause in §4B1.2 is unconstitutionally vague in light of Johnson) and United States v. Wilson, 622 F. App'x 393, 405 n.51 (5th Cir. 2015) (in considering the applicability of Johnson, noting "[o]ur case law indicates that a defendant cannot bring a vagueness challenge against a Sentencing Guideline"), with United States v. Taylor, 803 F.3d 931 (8th Cir. 2015) (finding that previous circuit precedent holding that the guidelines cannot be unconstitutionally vague because they do not proscribe conduct is doubtful after Johnson); United States v. Madrid, 805 F.3d 1204, 1211 (10th Cir. 2015) (holding that the residual clause of §4B1.2(a)(2) is void for vagueness); United States v. Harbin, 610 F. App'x 562 (6th Cir. 2015) (finding that defendant is entitled to the same relief as offenders sentenced under the residual clause of the ACCA); and United States v. Townsend, \_\_ F. App'x \_\_, 2015 WL 9311394, at \*4 (3d Cir. Dec. 23, 2015) (remanding for resentencing in light of the government's concession that, pursuant to Johnson, the defendant should not have been sentenced as a career offender).

The Commission determined that the residual clause at §4B1.2 implicates many of the same concerns cited by the Supreme Court in Johnson, and, as a matter of policy, amends §4B1.2(a)(2) to strike the clause. Removing the residual clause has the advantage of alleviating the considerable application difficulties associated with that clause, as expressed by judges, probation officers, and litigants. Furthermore, removing the clause will alleviate some of the ongoing litigation and uncertainty resulting from the Johnson decision.

# List of Enumerated Offenses

With the deletion of the residual clause under subsection (a)(2), there are two remaining components of the "crime of violence" definition – the "elements clause" and the "enumerated offenses clause." The "elements clause" set forth in subsection (a)(1) remains unchanged by the amendment. Thus, any offense under federal or state law, punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year, qualifies as a "crime of violence" if it has as an element the use, or attempted use, or threatened use of physical force against the person of another. Importantly, such an offense may, but need not, be specifically enumerated in subsection (a)(2) to qualify as a crime of violence.

The "enumerated offense clause" identifies specific offenses that qualify as crimes of violence. In applying this clause, courts compare the elements of the predicate offense of conviction with the elements of the enumerated offense in its "generic, contemporary definition." As has always been the case, such offenses qualify as crimes of violence regardless of whether the offense expressly has as an element the use, attempted use, or threatened use of physical force against the person of another. While most of the offenses on the enumerated list under §4B1.2(a)(2) remain the same, the amendment does revise the list in a number of ways to focus on the most dangerous repeat offenders. The revised list is based on the

Commission's consideration of public hearing testimony, a review of extensive public comment, and an examination of sentencing data relating to the risk of violence in these offenses and the recidivism rates of career offenders. Additionally, the Commission's revisions to the enumerated list also consider and reflect the fact that offenses not specifically enumerated will continue to qualify as a crime of violence if they satisfy the elements clause.

As amended, the enumerated offenses include murder, voluntary manslaughter, kidnapping, aggravated assault, forcible sex offenses, robbery, arson, extortion, or the use or unlawful possession of a firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a) or explosive material as defined in 18 U.S.C. § 841(c). For easier application, all enumerated offenses are now included in the guideline at §4B1.2; prior to the amendment, the list was set forth in both §4B1.2(a)(2) and the commentary at Application Note 1.

Manslaughter, which is currently enumerated in Application Note 1, is revised to include only voluntary manslaughter. While Commission analysis indicates that it is rare for involuntary manslaughter to be identified as a predicate for the career offender guideline, this change provides that only voluntary manslaughter should be considered. This is also consistent with the fact that involuntary manslaughter generally would not have qualified as a crime of violence under the "residual clause." <u>See Begay v.</u> <u>United States</u>, 553 U.S. 137 (2008) (limiting crimes covered by the ACCA residual clause to those roughly similar in kind and degree of risk posed as the enumerated offenses, which typically involve "purposeful, violent, and aggressive conduct").

The amendment deletes "burglary of a dwelling" from the list of enumerated offenses. In implementing this change, the Commission considered that (1) burglary offenses rarely result in physical violence, (2) "burglary of a dwelling" is rarely the instant offense of conviction or the determinative predicate for purposes of triggering higher penalties under the career offender guideline, and (3) historically, career offenders have rarely been rearrested for a burglary offense after release. The Commission considered several studies and analyses in reaching these conclusions.

First, several recent studies demonstrate that most burglaries do not involve physical violence. See Bureau of Justice Statistics, National Crime Victimization Survey, Victimization During Household Burglary (Sept. 2010) (finding that a household member experienced some form of violent victimization in 7% of all household burglaries from 2003 to 2007); Richard S. Culp et al., Is Burglary a Crime of Violence? An Analysis of National Data 1998-2007, at 29 (2015), available at https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/248651.pdf (concluding that 7.6% of burglaries between 1998 and 2007 resulted in actual violence or threats of violence, while actual physical injury was reported in only 2.7% of all burglaries); see also United States Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Investigation, Uniform Crime Report, Crime in the United States (2014) (classifying burglary as a "property crime" rather than a "violent crime"). Second, based upon an analysis of offenders sentenced in fiscal year 2014, the Commission estimates that removing "burglary of a dwelling" as an enumerated offense in \$4B1.2(a)(2) will reduce the overall proportion of offenders who qualify as a career offender by less than three percentage points. The Commission further estimates that removing the enumerated offense would result in only about five percent of offenders sentenced under USSG §2K2.1 (Unlawful Receipt, Possession, or Transportation of Firearms or Ammunition; Prohibited Transactions Involving Firearms or Ammunition) receiving a lower base offense level than would currently apply. Finally, a Commission analysis of recidivism rates for career offenders released during calendar years 2004 through 2006 indicates that about five percent of such offenders were rearrested for a burglary offense during the eight years after their release.

In reaching this conclusion, the Commission also considered that courts have struggled with identifying a uniform contemporary, generic definition of "burglary of dwelling." In particular, circuits have disagreed regarding whether the requirement in <u>Taylor v. United States</u>, 495 U.S. 575, 598 (1990), that

the burglary be of a "building or other structure" applies in addition to the guidelines' requirement that the burglary be of a "dwelling." <u>Compare United States v. Henriquez</u>, 757 F.3d 144, 148-49 (4th Cir. 2014); <u>United States v. McFalls</u>, 592 F.3d 707 (6th Cir. 2010); <u>United States v. Wenner</u>, 351 F.3d 969 (9th Cir. 2003) <u>with United States v. Ramirez</u>, 708 F.3d 295, 301 (1st Cir. 2013); <u>United States v.</u> <u>Murillo-Lopez</u>, 444 F.3d 337, 340 (5th Cir. 2006); <u>United States v. Rivera-Oros</u>, 590 F.3d 1123 (10th Cir. 2009); <u>United States v. McClenton</u>, 53 F.3d 584 (3d Cir. 1995); <u>United States v. Graham</u>, 982 F.2d 315 (8th Cir. 1992).

Although "burglary of a dwelling" is deleted as an enumerated offense, the amendment adds an upward departure provision to §4B1.2 to address the unusual case in which the instant offense or a prior felony conviction was any burglary offense involving violence that did not otherwise qualify as a "crime of violence." This departure provision allows courts to consider all burglary offenses, as opposed to just burglaries of a dwelling, and reflects the Commission's determination that courts should consider an upward departure where a defendant would have received a higher offense level, higher Criminal History Category, or both (e.g., where the defendant would have been a career offender) if such burglary had qualified as a "crime of violence."

Finally, the amendment adds offenses that involve the "use or unlawful possession of a firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a) or an explosive material as defined in 18 U.S.C. § 841(c)" to the enumerated list at §4B1.2(a)(2). This addition is consistent with long-standing commentary in §4B1.2 categorically identifying possession of a firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a) as a "crime of violence," and therefore maintains the status quo. The Commission continues to believe that possession of these types of weapons (e.g., a sawed-off shotgun or sawed-off rifle, silencer, bomb, or machine gun) inherently presents a serious potential risk of physical injury to another person. Additionally, inclusion as an enumerated offense reflects Congress's determination that such weapons are inherently dangerous and, when possessed unlawfully, serve only violent purposes. <u>See also</u> USSG App. C, amend. 674 (eff. Nov. 1, 2004) (expanding the definition of "crime of violence" in Application Note 1 to §4B1.2 to include unlawful possession of any firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a)).

# Enumerated Offense Definitions

The amendment also adds definitions for the enumerated offenses of forcible sex offense and extortion. The amended guideline, however, continues to rely on existing case law for purposes of defining the remaining enumerated offenses. The Commission determined that adding several new definitions could result in new litigation, and that it was instead best not to disturb the case law that has developed over the years.

As amended, "forcible sex offense" includes offenses with an element that consent to the conduct is not given or is not legally valid, such as where consent to the conduct is involuntary, incompetent, or coerced. Consistent with the definition in §2L1.2 (Unlawfully Entering or Remaining in the United States), this addition reflects the Commission's determination that certain forcible sex offenses which do not expressly include as an element the use, attempted use, or threatened use of physical force against the person of another should nevertheless constitute "crimes of violence" under §4B1.2. <u>See also</u> USSG App. C, amend. 722 (eff. Nov. 1, 2008) (clarifying the scope of the term "forcible sex offense" as that term is used in the definition of "crime of violence" in §2L1.2, Application Note 1(B)(iii)).

The new commentary also provides that the offenses of sexual abuse of a minor and statutory rape are included only if the sexual abuse of a minor or statutory rape was (A) an offense described in 18 U.S.C. \$ 2241(c), or (B) an offense under state law that would have been an offense under section 2241(c) if the offense had occurred within the special maritime and territorial jurisdiction of the United States. This

addition makes clear that the term "forcible sex offense" in §4B1.2 includes sexual abuse of a minor and statutory rape where certain specified elements are present.

"Extortion" is defined as "obtaining something of value from another by the wrongful use of (i) force, (ii) fear of physical injury, or (iii) threat of physical injury." Under case law existing at the time of this amendment, courts generally defined extortion as "obtaining something of value from another with his consent induced by the wrongful use of force, fear, or threats" based on the Supreme Court's holding in <u>United States v. Nardello</u>, 393 U.S. 286, 290 (1969) (defining "extortion" for purposes of the Hobbs Act). Consistent with the Commission's goal of focusing the career offender and related enhancements on the most dangerous offenders, the amendment narrows the generic definition of extortion by limiting the offense to those having an element of force or an element of fear or threats "of physical injury," as opposed to non-violent threats such as injury to reputation.

#### Departure Provision at §4B1.1

Finally, the amendment adds a downward departure provision in §4B1.1 for cases in which one or both of the defendant's "two prior felony convictions" is based on an offense that is classified as a misdemeanor at the time of sentencing for the instant federal offense.

An offense (whether a "crime of violence" or a "controlled substance offense") is deemed to be a "felony" for purposes of the career offender guideline if it is punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year. This definition captures some state offenses that are punishable by more than a year of imprisonment, but are in fact classified by the state as misdemeanors. Such statutes are found, for example, in Colorado, Iowa, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Pennsylvania, South Carolina, and Vermont.

The Commission determined that the application of the career offender guideline where one or both of the defendant's "two prior felony convictions" is an offense that is classified as a misdemeanor may result in a guideline range that substantially overrepresents the seriousness of the defendant's criminal history or substantially overstates the seriousness of the instant offense. While recognizing the importance of maintaining a uniform and consistent definition of the term "felony" in the guidelines, the Commission determined that it is also appropriate for a court to consider the seriousness of the prior offenses (as reflected in the classification assigned by the convicting jurisdiction) in deciding whether the significant increases under the career offender guideline are appropriate. Such consideration is consistent with the structure used by Congress in the context of the Armed Career Criminal Act. See 18 U.S.C. § 921(a)(20) (providing, for purposes of Chapter 44 of Title 18, that "crime punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year" does not include a State offense classified as a misdemeanor and punishable by two years or less). It is also consistent with the court's obligation to account for the "nature and circumstances of the offense and the history and characteristics of the defendant." See 18 U.S.C. § 3553(a)(1).

#### Amendment:

#### §4B1.2. Definitions of Terms Used in Section 4B1.1

- (a) The term "crime of violence" means any offense under federal or state law, punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year, that—
  - (1) has as an element the use, attempted use, or threatened use of physical force against the person of another, or

- (2) is murder, voluntary manslaughter, kidnapping, aggravated assault, a forcible sex offense, robbery, burglary of a dwelling, arson, or extortion, or the use or unlawful possession of a firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a) or explosive material as defined in 18 U.S.C. § 841(c) involves use of explosives, or otherwise involves conduct that presents a serious potential risk of physical injury to another.
- (b) The term "controlled substance offense" means an offense under federal or state law, punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year, that prohibits the manufacture, import, export, distribution, or dispensing of a controlled substance (or a counterfeit substance) or the possession of a controlled substance (or a counterfeit substance) with intent to manufacture, import, export, distribute, or dispense.
- (c) The term "two prior felony convictions" means (1) the defendant committed the instant offense of conviction subsequent to sustaining at least two felony convictions of either a crime of violence or a controlled substance offense (<u>i.e.</u>, two felony convictions of a crime of violence, two felony convictions of a controlled substance offense, or one felony conviction of a crime of violence and one felony conviction of a controlled substance offense), and (2) the sentences for at least two of the aforementioned felony convictions are counted separately under the provisions of §4A1.1(a), (b), or (c). The date that a defendant sustained a conviction shall be the date that the guilt of the defendant has been established, whether by guilty plea, trial, or plea of <u>nolo contendere</u>.

#### **Commentary**

#### Application Notes:

1. <u>Definitions</u>.—For purposes of this guideline—

"Crime of violence" and "controlled substance offense" include the offenses of aiding and abetting, conspiring, and attempting to commit such offenses.

"Forcible sex offense" includes where consent to the conduct is not given or is not legally valid, such as where consent to the conduct is involuntary, incompetent, or coerced. The offenses of sexual abuse of a minor and statutory rape are included only if the sexual abuse of a minor or statutory rape was (A) an offense described in 18 U.S.C. § 2241(c) or (B) an offense under state law that would have been an offense under section 2241(c) if the offense had occurred within the special maritime and territorial jurisdiction of the United States.

"Extortion" is obtaining something of value from another by the wrongful use of (A) force, (B) fear of physical injury, or (C) threat of physical injury.

"Crime of violence" includes murder, manslaughter, kidnapping, aggravated assault, forcible sex offenses, robbery, arson, extortion, extortionate extension of credit, and burglary of a dwelling. Other offenses are included as "crimes of violence" if ( $\Lambda$ ) that offense has as an element the use, attempted use, or threatened use of physical force against the person of another, or (B) the conduct set forth (<u>i.e.</u>, expressly charged) in the count of which the defendant was convicted involved use of explosives (including any explosive material or destructive device) or, by its nature, presented a serious potential risk of physical injury to another. "Crime of violence" does not include the offense of unlawful possession of a firearm by a felon, unless the possession was of a firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a). Where the instant offense of conviction is the unlawful possession of a firearm by a felon, §2K2.1 (Unlawful Receipt, Possession, or Transportation of Firearms or Ammunition; Prohibited Transactions Involving Firearms or Ammunition) provides an increase in offense level if the defendant had one or more prior felony convictions for a crime of violence or controlled substance offense; and, if the defendant is sentenced under the provisions of 18 U.S.C. § 924(e), §4B1.4 (Armed Career Criminal) will apply.

Unlawfully possessing a listed chemical with intent to manufacture a controlled substance (21 U.S.C. § 841(c)(1)) is a "controlled substance offense."

Unlawfully possessing a firearm described in 26 U.S.C. § 5845(a) (e.g., a sawed off shotgun or sawed off rifle, silencer, bomb, or machine gun) is a "crime of violence".

Unlawfully possessing a prohibited flask or equipment with intent to manufacture a controlled substance (21 U.S.C. § 843(a)(6)) is a "controlled substance offense."

Maintaining any place for the purpose of facilitating a drug offense (21 U.S.C. § 856) is a "controlled substance offense" if the offense of conviction established that the underlying offense (the offense facilitated) was a "controlled substance offense."

Using a communications facility in committing, causing, or facilitating a drug offense (21 U.S.C. § 843(b)) is a "controlled substance offense" if the offense of conviction established that the underlying offense (the offense committed, caused, or facilitated) was a "controlled substance offense."

A violation of 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a) is a "crime of violence" or a "controlled substance offense" if the offense of conviction established that the underlying offense was a "crime of violence" or a "controlled substance offense". (Note that in the case of a prior 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a) conviction, if the defendant also was convicted of the underlying offense, the sentences for the two prior convictions will be treated as a single sentence under §4A1.2 (Definitions and Instructions for Computing Criminal History).)

"Prior felony conviction" means a prior adult federal or state conviction for an offense punishable by death or imprisonment for a term exceeding one year, regardless of whether such offense is specifically designated as a felony and regardless of the actual sentence imposed. A conviction for an offense committed at age eighteen or older is an adult conviction. A conviction for an offense committed prior to age eighteen is an adult conviction if it is classified as an adult conviction under the laws of the jurisdiction in which the defendant was convicted (e.g., a federal conviction for an offense committed prior to the defendant's eighteenth birthday is an adult conviction if the defendant was expressly proceeded against as an adult).

- 2. <u>Offense of Conviction as Focus of Inquiry</u>.—Section 4B1.1 (Career Offender) expressly provides that the instant and prior offenses must be crimes of violence or controlled substance offenses of which the defendant was convicted. Therefore, in determining whether an offense is a crime of violence or controlled substance for the purposes of §4B1.1 (Career Offender), the offense of conviction (<u>i.e.</u>, the conduct of which the defendant was convicted) is the focus of inquiry.
- 3. <u>Applicability of §4A1.2</u>.—The provisions of §4A1.2 (Definitions and Instructions for Computing Criminal History) are applicable to the counting of convictions under §4B1.1.

4. <u>Upward Departure for Burglary Involving Violence</u>.—There may be cases in which a burglary involves violence, but does not qualify as a "crime of violence" as defined in §4B1.2(a) and, as a result, the defendant does not receive a higher offense level or higher Criminal History Category that would have applied if the burglary qualified as a "crime of violence." In such a case, an upward departure may be appropriate.

\* \* \*

#### §4B1.1. Career Offender

- (a) A defendant is a career offender if (1) the defendant was at least eighteen years old at the time the defendant committed the instant offense of conviction; (2) the instant offense of conviction is a felony that is either a crime of violence or a controlled substance offense; and (3) the defendant has at least two prior felony convictions of either a crime of violence or a controlled substance offense.
- (b) Except as provided in subsection (c), if the offense level for a career offender from the table in this subsection is greater than the offense level otherwise applicable, the offense level from the table in this subsection shall apply. A career offender's criminal history category in every case under this subsection shall be Category VI.

Offense Statutory Maximum		Offense Level*
(1)	Life	37
(2)	25 years or more	34
(3)	20 years or more, but less than 25 years	32
(4)	15 years or more, but less than 20 years	29
(5)	10 years or more, but less than 15 years	24
(6)	5 years or more, but less than 10 years	17
(7)	More than 1 year, but less than 5 years	12.

\*If an adjustment from §3E1.1 (Acceptance of Responsibility) applies, decrease the offense level by the number of levels corresponding to that adjustment.

- (c) If the defendant is convicted of 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a), and the defendant is determined to be a career offender under subsection (a), the applicable guideline range shall be determined as follows:
  - (1) If the only count of conviction is 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a), the applicable guideline range shall be determined using the table in subsection (c)(3).
  - (2) In the case of multiple counts of conviction in which at least one of the counts is a conviction other than a conviction for 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a), the guideline range shall be the greater of—
    - (A) the guideline range that results by adding the mandatory minimum consecutive penalty required by the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a) count(s) to the minimum and the maximum of the otherwise applicable guideline range determined for the count(s) of conviction other than the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a) count(s); and

(B) the guideline range determined using the table in subsection (c)(3).

#### (3) Career Offender Table for 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a) Offenders

<u>§3E1.1 Reduction</u>	<u>Guideline Range for the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a)</u> <u>Count(s)</u>
No reduction	360-life
2-level reduction	292-365
3-level reduction	262-327.

#### *Commentary*

#### Application Notes:

- 1. <u>Definitions.</u>—"Crime of violence," "controlled substance offense," and "two prior felony convictions" are defined in §4B1.2.
- 2. <u>"Offense Statutory Maximum"</u>.—"Offense Statutory Maximum," for the purposes of this guideline, refers to the maximum term of imprisonment authorized for the offense of conviction that is a crime of violence or controlled substance offense, including any increase in that maximum term under a sentencing enhancement provision that applies because of the defendant's prior criminal record (such sentencing enhancement provisions are contained, for example, in 21 U.S.C. § 841(b)(1)(A), (B), (C), and (D)). For example, in a case in which the statutory maximum term of imprisonment under 21 U.S.C. § 841(b)(1)(C) is increased from twenty years to thirty years because the defendant has one or more qualifying prior drug convictions, the "Offense Statutory Maximum" for that defendant for the purposes of this guideline is thirty years and not twenty years. If more than one count of conviction is of a crime of violence or controlled substance offense, use the maximum authorized term of imprisonment for the count that has the greatest offense statutory maximum.
- 3. <u>Application of Subsection (c)</u>.—
  - (A) <u>In General</u>.—Subsection (c) applies in any case in which the defendant (i) was convicted of violating 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a); and (ii) as a result of that conviction (alone or in addition to another offense of conviction), is determined to be a career offender under §4B1.1(a).
  - (B) <u>Subsection (c)(2)</u>.—To determine the greater guideline range under subsection (c)(2), the court shall use the guideline range with the highest minimum term of imprisonment.
  - (C) "<u>Otherwise Applicable Guideline Range</u>".—For purposes of subsection (c)(2)(A), "otherwise applicable guideline range" for the count(s) of conviction other than the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or 18 U.S.C. § 929(a) count(s) is determined as follows:
    - (i) If the count(s) of conviction other than the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or 18 U.S.C. § 929(a) count(s) does not qualify the defendant as a career offender, the otherwise applicable guideline range for that count(s) is the guideline range determined using: (I) the Chapter Two and Three offense level for that count(s); and (II) the appropriate criminal history category determined under §§4A1.1 (Criminal History Category) and 4A1.2 (Definitions and Instructions for Computing Criminal History).

- (ii) If the count(s) of conviction other than the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or 18 U.S.C. § 929(a) count(s) qualifies the defendant as a career offender, the otherwise applicable guideline range for that count(s) is the guideline range determined for that count(s) under §4B1.1(a) and (b).
- (D) <u>Imposition of Consecutive Term of Imprisonment</u>.—In a case involving multiple counts, the sentence shall be imposed according to the rules in subsection (e) of §5G1.2 (Sentencing on Multiple Counts of Conviction).
- (E) <u>Example</u>.—The following example illustrates the application of subsection (c)(2) in a multiple count situation:

The defendant is convicted of one count of violating 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) for possessing a firearm in furtherance of a drug trafficking offense (5 year mandatory minimum), and one count of violating 21 U.S.C. § 841(b)(1)(B) (5 year mandatory minimum, 40 year statutory maximum). Applying subsection (c)(2)(A), the court determines that the drug count (without regard to the 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) count) qualifies the defendant as a career offender under §4B1.1(a). Under §4B1.1(a), the otherwise applicable guideline range for the drug count is 188-235 months (using offense level 34 (because the statutory maximum for the drug count is 40 years), minus 3 levels for acceptance of responsibility, and criminal history category VI). The court adds 60 months (the minimum required by 18 U.S.C. § 924(c)) to the minimum and the maximum of that range, resulting in a guideline range from the table in subsection (c)(2)(B), the court then determines the career offender guideline range from the table in subsection (c)(3) is 262-327 months. The range with the greatest minimum, 262-327 months, is used to impose the sentence in accordance with §5G1.2(e).

4. <u>Departure Provision for State Misdemeanors</u>.—In a case in which one or both of the defendant's "two prior felony convictions" is based on an offense that was classified as a misdemeanor at the time of sentencing for the instant federal offense, application of the career offender guideline may result in a guideline range that substantially overrepresents the seriousness of the defendant's criminal history or substantially overstates the seriousness of the instant offense. In such a case, a downward departure may be warranted without regard to the limitation in §4A1.3(b)(3)(A).

<u>Background</u>: Section 994(h) of Title 28, United States Code, mandates that the Commission assure that certain "career" offenders receive a sentence of imprisonment "at or near the maximum term authorized." Section 4B1.1 implements this directive, with the definition of a career offender tracking in large part the criteria set forth in 28 U.S.C. § 994(h). However, in accord with its general guideline promulgation authority under 28 U.S.C. § 994(a)-(f), and its amendment authority under 28 U.S.C. § 994(a)-(f), and its amendment authority under 28 U.S.C. § 994(a) and (p), the Commission has modified this definition in several respects to focus more precisely on the class of recidivist offenders for whom a lengthy term of imprisonment is appropriate and to avoid "unwarranted sentencing disparities among defendants with similar records who have been found guilty of similar criminal conduct ....." 28 U.S.C. § 991(b)(1)(B). The Commission's refinement of this definition over time is consistent with Congress's choice of a directive to the Commission rather than a mandatory minimum sentencing statute ("The [Senate Judiciary] Committee believes that such a directive to the Commission will be more effective; the guidelines development process can assure consistent and rational implementation for the Committee's view that substantial prison terms should be imposed on repeat violent offenders and repeat drug traffickers." S. Rep. No. 225, 98th Cong., 1st Sess. 175 (1983)).

Subsection (c) provides rules for determining the sentence for career offenders who have been convicted of 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) or § 929(a). The Career Offender Table in subsection (c)(3) provides a sentence at or near the statutory maximum for these offenders by using guideline ranges that correspond to criminal history category VI and offense level 37 (assuming §3E.1.1 (Acceptance of Responsibility) does not apply), offense

level 35 (assuming a 2-level reduction under §3E.1.1 applies), and offense level 34 (assuming a 3-level reduction under §3E1.1 applies).

\* \* \*