

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Executive Summary</i>	xxv
A. OVERVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS	xxv
B. SUMMARY OF DATA ANALYSES BY OFFENSE TYPE	xxxii
 <i>Chapter 1</i>	
OVERVIEW	1
A. INTRODUCTION	1
B. OVERVIEW OF REPORT	3
1. <i>Methodology</i>	3
2. <i>Definitions of Key Terms</i>	4
3. <i>Organization</i>	5
 <i>Chapter 2</i>	
HISTORY OF MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES AND STATUTORY RELIEF MECHANISMS	7
A. INTRODUCTION	7
B. MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES IN THE EARLY REPUBLIC	7
C. MANDATORY PENALTIES IN THE CIVIL WAR ERA	13
D. THE REVISED STATUTES: MANDATORY MINIMUMS AFTER THE CIVIL WAR	15
E. THE 1909 CRIMINAL CODE AND SUBSEQUENT CODIFICATIONS IN THE FIRST HALF OF THE 20TH CENTURY	18
F. MANDATORY PENALTIES FROM THE MID-TWENTIETH CENTURY	22
1. <i>Introduction</i>	22
2. <i>Mandatory Minimum Penalties for Drug Offenses</i>	23
3. <i>Mandatory Minimum Penalties for Firearms Offenses</i>	25
4. <i>Mandatory Minimum Penalties for Child Sexual Exploitation and Related Offenses</i>	27
5. <i>Mandatory Minimum Penalties for Identity Theft Offenses</i>	29
G. RECONSIDERATION OF CERTAIN MANDATORY MINIMUMS: THE FAIR SENTENCING ACT OF 2010	29
H. MECHANISMS FOR RELIEF FROM MANDATORY MINIMUMS PENALTIES	31
1. <i>Introduction</i>	31
2. <i>Substantial Assistance to the Authorities</i>	32
3. <i>The Safety Valve</i>	34
 <i>Chapter 3</i>	
THE INTERACTION BETWEEN MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES AND THE SENTENCING GUIDELINES	37
A. INTRODUCTION	37
B. DEVELOPMENT AND OPERATION OF THE GUIDELINES	37
1. <i>History of the Sentencing Reform Act</i>	37

2. <i>The Sentencing Reform Act's Requirements</i>	40
3. <i>Operation of the Sentencing Guidelines</i>	42
4. <i>Amending the Guidelines</i>	47
5. <i>Constitutionality of Mandatory Minimum Penalties</i>	50
C. INCORPORATION OF MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES INTO THE GUIDELINES.....	53
D. COMPARING THE GUIDELINES AND MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	57

Chapter 4

CHANGES IN THE FEDERAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM, MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES, AND THE FEDERAL PRISON POPULATION	63
---	----

A. INTRODUCTION	63
B. SYSTEMIC CHANGES TO THE FEDERAL CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM	63
1. <i>Increased Federalization of Criminal Law</i>	63
2. <i>Changes in the Size and Composition of the Federal Criminal Docket</i>	66
3. <i>Increased Imposition of Sentences of Imprisonment</i>	69
C. CHANGES IN MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	71
1. <i>Expansion of Mandatory Minimum Penalties</i>	71
2. <i>Changes in Types of Offenses Subject to Mandatory Minimums</i>	72
3. <i>Increases in the Severity of Penalties for Mandatory Minimum Offenses</i>	75
D. CHANGES IN THE SIZE AND COMPOSITION OF THE FEDERAL PRISON POPULATION	76

Chapter 5

POLICY VIEWS ABOUT MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	85
--	----

A. INTRODUCTION	85
B. POLICY VIEWS IN FAVOR OF MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	85
1. <i>Promotion of Uniformity in Sentencing and Avoidance of Unwarranted Disparity</i>	85
2. <i>Protection of the Public through Certainty in Punishment, Deterrence, and Incapacitation</i>	86
3. <i>Retribution</i>	88
4. <i>Effective Law Enforcement Tool that Induces Pleas and Cooperation</i>	89
5. <i>Assistance to State and Local Law Enforcement</i>	89
C. POLICY VIEWS AGAINST MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	90
1. <i>Contribution to Excessive Uniformity and Unwarranted Disparity</i>	90
2. <i>Excessive Severity and Disproportionality</i>	92
3. <i>Lack of Individualized Sentencing</i>	95
4. <i>Transfer of Sentencing Discretion from Judges to Prosecutors</i>	96
5. <i>Ineffectiveness as a Deterrent or as a Law Enforcement Tool to Induce Pleas and Cooperation</i>	98
6. <i>Interference with State Law Enforcement</i>	100
7. <i>Impact Across Demographic Groups</i>	101
D. CONCLUSION.....	103

<i>Chapter 6</i>	
THE USE OF MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES IN SELECTED DISTRICTS	105
A. INTRODUCTION	105
B. METHODOLOGY	105
C. OVERVIEW OF THE USE OF OFFENSES CARRYING MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	106
1. <i>Charging Decisions</i>	107
2. <i>Plea Negotiations</i>	108
3. <i>Binding Plea Agreements – Fed. R. Crim. P. 11(c)(1)(C)</i>	109
4. <i>Substantial Assistance</i>	110
D. SPECIFIC OFFENSE TYPES CARRYING MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES.....	111
1. <i>Drug Offenses</i>	111
2. <i>Firearms Offenses – 18 U.S.C. § 924(c) Violations</i>	113
3. <i>Child Pornography Offenses – Possession vs. Receipt</i>	114
4. <i>Aggravated Identity Theft – 18 U.S.C. § 1028A Violations</i>	115
E. MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES IN PRACTICE.....	115
1. <i>Defendants’ Prior Knowledge about Mandatory Minimum Penalties</i>	115
2. <i>Incentive to Plead Guilty</i>	115
3. <i>Trial Rates Driven by Mandatory Minimum Penalties</i>	116
4. <i>Impact on Willingness to Provide Substantial Assistance</i>	116
5. <i>False Testimony by Cooperators</i>	117
6. <i>Safety Valve</i>	117
<i>Chapter 7</i>	
STATISTICAL OVERVIEW OF MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES	119
A. INTRODUCTION	119
B. METHODOLOGY	119
C. STATISTICAL OVERVIEW.....	121
1. <i>Demographic Characteristics</i>	122
2. <i>Criminal History</i>	124
3. <i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	125
4. <i>Geographic Variations</i>	128
5. <i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	132
D. SENTENCING OUTCOMES	136
1. <i>Average Sentence Length</i>	136
2. <i>Sentences Relative to the Applicable Guideline Range</i>	139
E. PRISON IMPACT.....	140
1. <i>Introduction</i>	140
2. <i>Male Offenders</i>	141
3. <i>Female Offenders</i>	143
F. SUMMARY.....	146
<i>Chapter 8</i>	
MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES FOR DRUG OFFENSES	149
A. INTRODUCTION	149
B. DRUG OFFENSES AND RELATED GUIDELINES	150
C. STATISTICAL OVERVIEW OF DRUG OFFENSES.....	152

1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Drug Offenders</i>	153
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	155
3.	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	156
4.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	158
5.	<i>Sentencing Outcomes</i>	160
6.	<i>Prison Impact</i>	164
7.	<i>Offender Function</i>	165
D.	POWDER COCAINE OFFENSES	173
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Powder Cocaine Offenders</i>	173
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	177
3	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	177
4.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	178
5.	<i>Sentencing Outcomes</i>	180
6.	<i>Prison Impact</i>	185
7.	<i>Offender Function</i>	185
8.	<i>Summary</i>	187
E.	CRACK COCAINE OFFENSES.....	191
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Crack Cocaine Offenders</i>	191
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	193
3.	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	194
4.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	195
5.	<i>Sentencing Outcomes</i>	196
6.	<i>Prison Impact</i>	203
7.	<i>Offender Function</i>	203
8.	<i>Summary</i>	205
F.	MARIJUANA OFFENSES	209
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Marijuana Offender</i>	209
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	212
3.	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	212
4.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	213
5.	<i>Sentencing Outcomes</i>	215
6.	<i>Prison Impact</i>	218
7.	<i>Offender Function</i>	218
8.	<i>Summary</i>	220
G.	METHAMPHETAMINE OFFENSES.....	223
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Methamphetamine Offenders</i>	224
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	226
3.	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	227
4.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	227
5.	<i>Sentencing Outcomes</i>	229
6.	<i>Prison Impact</i>	233
7.	<i>Offender Function</i>	233
8.	<i>Summary</i>	235
H.	HEROIN OFFENSES	239
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Heroin Offenders</i>	239
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	241

3. <i>Geographic Variations</i>	242
4. <i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	242
5. <i>Sentencing Outcomes</i>	244
6. <i>Prison Impact</i>	247
7. <i>Offender Function</i>	247
8. <i>Summary</i>	249
I. SECTION 851 ANALYSIS	252
1. <i>Introduction</i>	252
2. <i>Methodology</i>	253
3. <i>Geographic Variations</i>	255
4. <i>Demographic Characteristics of Offenders Eligible for Section 851 Enhancement</i>	256
5. <i>Drug Types Associated with Offenders Eligible for Section 851 Enhancement</i>	258
6. <i>Summary</i>	260
J. SUMMARY.....	261

Chapter 9

MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES FOR FIREARM OFFENSES	269
A. INTRODUCTION	269
B. THE STATUTES AND RELATED GUIDELINES	269
1. <i>18 U.S.C. § 924(c)</i>	269
2. <i>Armed Career Criminal Act, 18 U.S.C. § 924(e)</i>	271
3. <i>The Categorical Approach</i>	272
C. MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES FOR SECTION 924(C) OFFENSES	273
1. <i>Demographic Characteristics</i>	274
2. <i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	275
3. <i>Geographic Variations</i>	276
4. <i>Other Counts of Conviction</i>	278
5. <i>Sentence Length</i>	279
6. <i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	280
7. <i>Guidelines Compared</i>	281
D. MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES UNDER THE ARMED CAREER CRIMINAL ACT	282
1. <i>Demographic Characteristics</i>	282
2. <i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	284
3. <i>Geographic Variations</i>	284
4. <i>Sentence Information</i>	286
5. <i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	287
E. PRISON IMPACT	288
F. SUMMARY.....	288

Chapter 10

MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES FOR SEX OFFENSES	295
A. INTRODUCTION	295
B. OFFENSES AND RELATED GUIDELINES	296
1. <i>Federal Sex Offenses</i>	296
2. <i>Related Guidelines</i>	299

C.	STATISTICAL OVERVIEW	300
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Sex Offenders</i>	301
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	304
3.	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	305
4.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	307
D.	SENTENCING OUTCOMES	309
1.	<i>Sentencing Outcomes Generally in Sex Offense Cases</i>	309
2.	<i>Special Coding Project: Application of Mandatory Minimum Penalties in Child Pornography Cases</i>	316
E.	PRISON IMPACT	319
F.	SUMMARY	319

Chapter 11

	MANDATORY MINIMUM PENALTIES FOR IDENTITY THEFT OFFENSES	325
A.	INTRODUCTION	325
B.	OFFENSES AND RELATED GUIDELINES	326
1.	<i>Identity Theft Offenses</i>	326
2.	<i>Related Guidelines</i>	328
C.	STATISTICAL OVERVIEW	329
1.	<i>Demographic Characteristics of Identity Theft Offenders</i>	331
2.	<i>Guilty Pleas and Trials</i>	332
3.	<i>Geographic Variations</i>	333
4.	<i>Application of Section 1028A</i>	334
D.	SENTENCING OUTCOMES	336
1.	<i>Sentence Length</i>	336
2.	<i>Relief from the Mandatory Minimum Penalty</i>	337
3.	<i>Stacking of Multiple Counts</i>	339
4.	<i>Demographic Characteristics and Average Sentence Length</i>	339
E.	PRISON IMPACT	341
F.	SUMMARY.....	342

Chapter 12

	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	345
A.	INTRODUCTION	345
B.	GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	345
C.	SPECIFIC CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	348
1.	<i>Drug Offenses</i>	349
2.	<i>Firearm Offenses</i>	356
3.	<i>Sex Offenses</i>	365
4.	<i>Identity Theft Offenses</i>	366
D.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	366
D.	CONCLUSION.....	369

APPENDICES

A.	Current Statutory Provisions Requiring Mandatory Minimum Terms of Imprisonment.....	A-1
B.	Pending Mandatory Minimum Legislation.....	B-1
C.	Table Listing Mandatory Minimums in the 1878 Revised Statutes	C-1
D.	Empirical Analysis of Mandatory Minimums – Tables and Figures.....	D-1
E.	Brief Review of Case Law Relating to Mandatory Minimum Sentences	E-1
F.	Field Interview Questions for Federal Prosecutors and Defense Attorneys	F-1
G.	Summaries of Oral and Written Remarks of the Witnesses to the Commission about Mandatory Minimum Penalties at May 27, 2010 Hearing.....	G-1
H.	Methodology for Offender Function Coding.....	H-1
I.	Bibliography	I-1
J.	Summaries of Oral and Written Remarks of the Witnesses to the Commission About the Topic of Mandatory Minimum Penalties at the Sentencing Reform Act 25th Anniversary Regional Hearings.....	J-1

